

Exhibit 24

Transcript of the Testimony of
Ray Perryman

Date:

June 27, 2018

Case:

STATE OF TEXAS vs UNITED STATES of AMERICA

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018

1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
3 BROWNSVILLE DIVISION
4
5 STATE OF TEXAS,)
6 Plaintiffs,) Case No.
7 vs.) 1:18-cv-00068
8 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,)
9 Defendants,)
0 and)
1 KARLA PEREZ, et al.,)
2 Defendant-Intervenors.)

14 ORAL DEPOSITION OF
15 RAY PERRYMAN

16 | Wednesday, June 27, 2018

18 Oral deposition of RAY PERRYMAN, produced as
19 a witness at the instance of the Plaintiff States, and
20 duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered
21 cause on the 27th day of June, 2018, from 2:00 p.m. to
22 4:44 p.m., before Deborah L. Endler, Notary Public in
23 and for the State of Texas, reported by stenographic
24 means, at the offices of the Attorney General, 300
25 West 15th Street, 11th Floor, Austin, Texas 78701,

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018

Page 2

1 pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and
2 the provisions stated on the record or attached
3 hereto.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018
Page 3

1 A P P E A R A N C E S

2 FOR THE PLAINTIFF STATES:

3 Todd Lawrence Disher, Attorney-in-Charge

4 OAG - Assistant Attorney General

5 Special Counsel for Civil Litigation

6 General Litigation Division

7 300 West 15th Street, 11th Floor

8 Austin, Texas 78701

9 512.463.2008

10 todd.disher@oag.texas.gov

11

12 FOR THE DEFENDANTS:

13 Keith Edward Wyatt, Assistant U.S. Attorney

14 U.S. Department of Justice, Civil Division

15 Southern District of Texas

16 1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 2300

17 Houston, Texas 77002

18 713.567.9713

19 keith.wyatt@usdoj.gov

20 (continued)

21

22

23

24

25

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018
Page 4

1 APPEARANCES: (continued)

2 FOR THE DEFENDANT-INTERVENORS:

3 Katherine A. Gregory

4 Office of the Attorney General of New Jersey

5 25 Market Street, 8th Floor

6 Trenton, New Jersey 08625

7 katherine.gregory@dol.lps.state.nj.us

8

9 FOR MALDEF:

10 Ernest I. Herrera, Esquire

11 Mexican American Legal Defense and Educational Fund

12 1100 Broadway, Suite 300

13 San Antonio, Texas 78205

14 eherrera@maldef.org

15

16 ALSO PRESENT: Joseph Shaneyfelt, Baylor Law Student

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018

Page 28

1 different way. If there are fewer workers in the
2 workforce, that can potentially increase wages?

3 A. It can. That's an unproductive thing to
4 have happen in society, but that can be one
5 consequence.

6 Q. Okay. Now, if we go down, it says retirees
7 have also been rehired? Do you see that?

8 A. Yes, sir.

9 Q. So that's saying in response to the labor
10 shortage, retirees have also been rehired; right?

11 A. I talk about several things. That's one of
12 them, yes, sir.

13 Q. Those retirees would have been outside of
14 the labor force participation prior to being rehired;
15 correct?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. So a labor shortage could potentially
18 increase labor force participation?

19 A. Well, depending on how people respond to
20 it, it can. What tends to happen is you have a trend
21 going on. It's going to be socially going up or going
22 down. And then depending on the economic conditions
23 you get fluctuations in that month to month. The
24 trend has been going down for a long time.

25 Q. Okay.

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018
Page 76

1 they all stayed, I don't think the number would
2 change. But clearly to the extent people are
3 classified as DACA, persons who are in the high school
4 at this point in time, their education is being
5 funded. But it's not because they are in DACA, it's
6 because they are here.

7 Q. And is being funded in part by the State of
8 Texas?

9 A. Correct, yes.

10 Q. And I jumped ahead of myself there. I
11 meant to ask you about health care.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. But same question as a lead-in, you don't
14 dispute that the State of Texas does indeed incur a
15 cost to provide health care to DACA recipients?

16 MR. HERRERA: Objection, asked and
17 answered.

18 A. Again, the only clarification I would give
19 is, again, for the undocumented population, since they
20 use it, a little bit less for the DACA based
21 population, but nonetheless I assume there would be
22 some people in the DACA population who are likely to
23 have some type of care that is reimbursed in some way
24 by the state.

25 Q. And those types of care would be things

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018
Page 97

1 MR. HERRERA: Objection, calls for
2 speculation.

3 A. Again, there is no way to know with
4 certainty. That would not be a shocking thing to have
5 happen, that you occasionally had something like that
6 occur.

7 Q. Do you think it's likely to happen?

8 MR. HERRERA: Objection, calls for
9 speculation.

10 A. Again, I'm not sure how else I can answer
11 it. It's certainly a theoretical possibility that it
12 could occur.

13 Q. Do you know from 2012 to present whether an
14 employer has hired a DACA recipient for a job that a
15 U.S. citizen also applied for?

16 A. I don't know one way or the other. It very
17 well could have happened, but I don't know.

18 Q. And going forward into the future, do you
19 know whether it is likely to happen again that an
20 employer will hire a DACA recipient to fill a job that
21 a U.S. citizen has also applied for?

22 MR. HERRERA: Objection, calls for
23 speculation and mischaracterizes the witness's
24 testimony.

25 A. Again, I have no way of knowing that. It's

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018
Page 110

1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
3 BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

4 STATE OF TEXAS,)
5 Plaintiffs,) Case No.
vs.) 1:18-cv-00068
6 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,)
Defendants,)
and)
7 KARLA PEREZ, et al.,)
Defendant-Intervenors.)

8 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION
9 DEPOSITION OF RAY PERRYMAN
June 27, 2018

10 I, Deborah Endler, Shorthand Reporter in and
11 for the State of Texas, do hereby certify that the
12 foregoing deposition is a full, true and correct
13 transcript:

14 That the foregoing deposition of RAY
15 PERRYMAN, the Witness, hereinbefore named was at the
16 time named, taken by me in stenograph on June 27,
17 2018, the said Witness having been by me first duly
18 cautioned and sworn to tell the truth, the whole truth
19 and nothing but the truth and the same were thereafter
20 reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction.

21 () That by agreement of counsel, a reading
22 condensed copy of the deposition transcript along with
23 the full-sized original Changes and Signature Sheet
24 has been sent to _____ on
25 _____ for review and signature within 30 days

Ray Perryman

June 27, 2018
Page 111

1 and if any corrections returned are attached hereto.

2 () That the Witness shall have thirty (30)
3 days for review and signature of the original
4 transcript and if any corrections returned are
5 attached hereto.

6 () That the signed transcript () was ()
7 was not received from the Witness within 30 days.

8 That the amount of time used by each party at
9 the deposition is as follows:

10 Mr. Disher - 2 hours, 44 minutes

11 That before the completion of the deposition,
12 the Deponent, andor the Plaintiff/Defendant ____ did
13 ____ did not request to review the transcript.

14 I further certify that I am neither counsel
15 for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or
16 attorneys in this action in which this proceeding was
17 taken, and further that I am not financially or
18 otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.

19 WITNESS MY HAND, this the 28th day of June,
20 2018.



22 DEBORAH L. ENDLER, Reporter
23 EXPIRATION DATE:
24 Firm Registration No. 631
25 Kim Tindall & Associates, LLC
16414 San Pedro, Suite 900
San Antonio, Texas 78232
Phone 210-697-3400